



## Australian Government

---

### Department of Infrastructure, Transport, Regional Development, Communications and the Arts

Our reference: FOI 25-108

By email to: [foi+request-12055-c5963be6@righttoknow.org.au](mailto:foi+request-12055-c5963be6@righttoknow.org.au)

Dear Applicant

## Decision on your Freedom of Information Request

On 15 September 2024, you submitted a request to the Department of Infrastructure, Transport, Regional Development, Communications and the Arts (the Department), seeking access to documents under the *Freedom of Information Act 1982* (FOI Act).

### 1 Your request

You requested access to:

Requesting the following for the computer game 'EA Sports UFC 5':

- application including all the stuff it needs to be processed except for video footage, copy of game;
- screenshot of the non-public webpage showing information from the database;
- e-mail to and from applicant during the classification process.

### 2 Authority to make decision

I am authorised by the Secretary to make decisions in relation to Freedom of Information requests under section 23(1) of the FOI Act.

### 3 Decision

I have identified 14 documents that I consider contain information that is relevant to your request. These documents were in the possession of the Department when your request was received.

I have decided to:

- grant access in full to relevant information in 11 documents.
- grant partial access to three documents.

A schedule setting out the documents relevant to your request, with my decision in relation to these documents, is at **ATTACHMENT A**.

## 4 Finding of facts and reasons for decision

My findings of fact and reasons for deciding that exemptions apply to parts of documents relevant to your request are set out below.

### 4.1 Section 47F – Documents affecting personal privacy

Section 47F of the FOI Act provides that a document is conditionally exempt if its disclosure would involve the unreasonable disclosure of personal information about any person (including a deceased person).

#### Personal Information

Personal information has the same meaning as in the Privacy Act. Specifically, section 6 of the Privacy Act provides that *personal information* means information or an opinion about an identified individual, or an individual who is reasonably identifiable whether the information or opinion is true or not; and whether the information or opinion is recorded in a material form or not.

Paragraph 6.126 of the FOI Guidelines states that for particular information to be personal information, an individual must be identified or reasonably identifiable.

Paragraph 6.125 of the FOI Guidelines states that personal information can include a person's name, address, telephone number, date of birth, medical records, bank account details, taxation information and signature.

An individual is a natural person rather than a corporation, trust, body politic or incorporated association.

I am satisfied that parts of the documents marked 's47F' include personal information about a number of individuals.

#### Unreasonable Disclosure of Personal Information

Section 47F(2) of the FOI Act provides that, in determining whether the disclosure would involve the unreasonable disclosure of personal information, I must have regard to the following matters:

- (a) the extent to which the information is well known
- (b) whether the person to whom the information relates is known to be (or to have been) associated with the matters dealt with in the document
- (c) the availability of the information from publicly accessible sources
- (d) any other matters that the agency or Minister considers relevant.

Paragraph 6.133 of the FOI Guidelines states that:

The personal privacy conditional exemption is designed to prevent the unreasonable invasion of third parties' privacy. The test of 'unreasonableness' implies a need to balance the public interest in disclosure of government-held information and the private interest in the privacy of individuals. The test does not, however, amount to the public interest test of s 11A(5), which follows later in the decision making process. It is possible that the decision maker may need to consider one or more factors twice, once to determine if a projected effect is unreasonable and again when assessing the public interest balance.

I note that the AAT, in *Re Chandra and Minister for Immigration and Ethnic Affairs [1984] AATA 437* at paragraph 259, stated that:

... whether a disclosure is 'unreasonable' requires ... a consideration of all the circumstances, including the nature of the information that would be disclosed, the circumstances in which the information was

obtained, the likelihood of the information being information that the person concerned would not wish to have disclosed without consent, and whether the information has any current relevance ... it is also necessary in my view to take into consideration the public interest recognised by the Act in the disclosure of information ... and to weigh that interest in the balance against the public interest in protecting the personal privacy of a third party ...

Paragraphs 6.137-6.139 of the FOI Guidelines state:

- 6.137 Key factors for determining whether disclosure is unreasonable include:
- the author of the document is identifiable
  - the documents contain third party personal information
  - release of the documents would cause stress on the third party
  - no public purpose would be achieved through release
- 6.138 As discussed in the IC review decision of *'FG' and National Archives of Australia [2015]* AICmr 26, other factors considered to be relevant include:
- the nature, age and current relevance of the information
  - any detriment that disclosure may cause to the person to whom the information relates
  - any opposition to disclosure expressed or likely to be held by that person
  - the circumstances of an agency's collection and use of the information
  - the fact that the FOI Act does not control or restrict any subsequent use or dissemination of information released under the FOI Act
  - any submission an FOI applicant chooses to make in support of their application as to their reasons for seeking access and their intended or likely use or dissemination of the information, and
  - whether disclosure of the information might advance the public interest in government transparency and integrity
- 6.139 The leading IC review decision on s 47F is 'BA' and Merit Protection Commissioner in which the Information Commissioner explained that the object of the FOI Act to promote transparency in government processes and activities needs to be balanced with the purpose of s 47F to protect personal privacy.

I am satisfied that the disclosure of personal information contained within the documents would, in the circumstances, constitute an unreasonable disclosure of personal information for the following reasons:

- the conditionally exempt personal information is not well known
- the person to whom the personal information relates is not known to be (or to have been) associated with the matters dealt with in the document
- the conditionally exempt personal information is not available from publicly accessible sources
- the individuals whose personal information is contained in the documents are identifiable
- release of this information would cause stress to the individuals concerned
- no further public purpose would be achieved through the release of the personal information, noting that the personal information is included in the document as a result of their employment circumstance
- the information is current and has not lost its sensitivity through the passage of time

- the individuals would not expect the information to be placed in the public domain, and detriment may be caused to the individuals to whom the information relates, and
- the FOI Act does not control or restrict any subsequent use or dissemination of information released under the FOI Act.

I have consulted with affected third parties regarding the disclosure of their personal information, and I have considered any concerns raised by those individuals during the course of making my decision.

For the reasons outlined above, I decided that parts of the documents marked 's47F' are conditionally exempt from disclosure under section 47F of the FOI Act.

Where information is found to be conditionally exempt, I must give access to that information unless access at this time would, on balance, be contrary to the public interest. I have addressed the public interest considerations below.

## 4.2 Public interest considerations

Pursuant to section 11A(5) of the FOI Act, I must give access to conditionally exempt information unless access to that information at that time would, on balance, be contrary to the public interest. I have therefore considered whether disclosure of the conditionally exempt information would be contrary to the public interest.

I note that paragraph 6.224 of the FOI Guidelines states that the public interest test is considered to be:

- something that is of serious concern or benefit to the public, not merely of individual interest
- not something of interest to the public, but in the interest of the public
- not a static concept, where it lies in a particular matter will often depend on a balancing of interests
- necessarily broad and non-specific and
- relates to matters of common concern or relevance to all members of the public, or a substantial section of the public.

### Factors favouring disclosure

Having regard to section 11B of the FOI Act, which provides the factors favouring access to conditionally exempt information in the public interest, I consider that disclosure of the conditionally exempt information at this time:

- 1) would provide access to documents held by an agency of the Commonwealth, which would promote the objects of the FOI Act by providing the Australian community with access to information held by the Australian Government
  - I note that paragraph 6.230 of the FOI Guidelines suggests it would be a rare case in which disclosure would not promote the objects of the FOI Act, including by increasing scrutiny, discussion, comment and review of the government's activities.
- 2) would not inform debate on a matter of public importance
- 3) would not promote effective oversight of public expenditure
- 4) would not allow you access to your own personal information
  - I note you are not seeking access to your own personal information and this factor is mute in my considerations.

## Factors weighing against disclosure

I consider that the following factors weigh against disclosure of the conditionally exempt information at this time, on the basis that disclosure:

- 1) could reasonably be expected to prejudice the protection of a number of individuals' right to personal privacy
  - The Department is committed to complying with its obligations under the *Privacy Act 1988*, which sets out standards and obligations that regulate how we must handle and manage personal information. I consider it is firmly in the public interest that we uphold the rights of individuals to their own privacy and meet our statutory obligations under the Privacy Act.
  - I note that the substance of the information that is relevant to your request has been released to you and disclosure of the conditionally exempt personal information would not provide you with any further insight into the workings of government beyond that substantive information.

In making my decision, I have not taken into account any of the irrelevant factors set out in section 11B(4) of the FOI Act.

### Conclusion – disclosure is not in the public interest

For the reasons set out above, after weighing all public interest factors for and against disclosure, I decided that, on balance, disclosure of the conditionally exempt information would be contrary to the public interest. I am satisfied that the benefit to the public resulting from disclosure of the conditionally exempt information is outweighed by the benefit to the public of withholding that information.

### 4.3 Section 22 – deletion of material from documents released to you

Section 22 of the FOI Act applies to documents containing irrelevant and/or exempt material and allows an agency to delete such material from a document.

#### Exempt material

As I decided that some information you have requested is exempt from disclosure, I have prepared an edited copy of the documents released to you by deleting the exempt information under section 22(1)(a)(i) of the FOI Act.

#### Irrelevant material

I decided that the documents captured by your request contain material which can reasonably be regarded as irrelevant to your request.

The documents contain personal identifiers of public servants. When your request was acknowledged, we notified you that personal information of public servants below the SES level and all email addresses, signatures and direct telephone numbers would be considered irrelevant to the scope of your request unless you told us that you were expressly seeking access to that information. On the basis that you did not notify us otherwise, I decided this information is irrelevant to your request.

As such, an edited copy of the documents has been prepared in accordance with section 22(1)(a)(ii) of the FOI Act. This information is marked 's22' in the documents released to you.

## 5 Material taken into consideration

In making my decision, I had regard to the following:

- the terms of your request
- the content of the documents captured by your request
- the provisions of the FOI Act
- the guidelines issued by the Australian Information Commissioner under section 93A of the FOI Act (the FOI Guidelines)
- advice from departmental officers with responsibility for the subject matter contained in the documents captured by your request
- submissions from third parties consulted about documents which contain information concerning them

## 6 Legislative provisions

The FOI Act, including the provisions referred to in my decision, are available on the Federal Register of Legislation website: [www.legislation.gov.au/Series/C2004A02562](http://www.legislation.gov.au/Series/C2004A02562).

## 7 Your review rights

If you are dissatisfied with my decision, you may apply for a review of it.

### 7.1 Internal review

You can request an internal review within 30 days of receiving this decision. An internal review will be conducted by a different departmental officer from the original decision-maker.

No particular form is required to apply for review although it will assist the Department if you are able to set out the grounds on which you believe that the original decision should be changed.

Applications for internal review can be sent to [FOI@infrastructure.gov.au](mailto:FOI@infrastructure.gov.au)

If you choose to seek an internal review, you will also have a right to apply for Information Commissioner review (IC review) of the internal review decision once it has been provided to you if you remain dissatisfied with the decision.

### 7.2 Information Commissioner review or complaint

An application for IC review must be made in writing to the Office of the Australian Information Commissioner (OAIC) within 60 days of the decision.

If you are not satisfied with the way we have handled your FOI request, you can lodge a complaint with the OAIC. However, the OAIC suggests that complaints are made to the agency in the first instance.

More information about the Information Commissioner reviews and complaints is available on the OAIC website here: [www.oaic.gov.au/freedom-of-information/foi-review-process](http://www.oaic.gov.au/freedom-of-information/foi-review-process).

## 8 Publication of material released under the FOI Act

Where I have decided to release documents to you, we may also publish the released material on our Disclosure Log. We will not publish personal or business affairs information where it would be unreasonable to do so.

For your reference our Disclosure Log can be found here: [www.infrastructure.gov.au/about-us/freedom-information/freedom-information-disclosure-log](http://www.infrastructure.gov.au/about-us/freedom-information/freedom-information-disclosure-log).

### Further information

If you require further information regarding this decision, please contact the Department's FOI Section at [FOI@infrastructure.gov.au](mailto:FOI@infrastructure.gov.au).

Yours sincerely



Mitchell Cole  
Assistant Secretary  
Classification Branch  
Digital Platforms, Safety and Classification Division

Date: 12 November 2024

**SCHEDULE OF DOCUMENTS FOI 25-108**

| Doc No. | Date of document        | Description of document  | Num of Pages | Decision on access                     | Provision of FOI Act |
|---------|-------------------------|--|--------------|--|----------------------|
| 1.      | 13/07/2023              | FOI 25-108 - Application Snapshot  | 7            | Partial access granted                 | s47F                 |
| 2.      | 27/07/2023              | FOI 25-108 - Blues Part 1 T23 20403-TB EA SPORTS UFC 5                                 | 6            | Access granted to relevant information | s22                  |
| 3.      | 27/07/2023              | FOI 25-108 - BLUES Part 2 T23_20403 JM UFC 5   | 2            | Access granted to relevant information | s22                  |
| 4.      | 15/08/2023              | FOI 25-108 - Board Report  | 4            | Access granted to relevant information | s22                  |
| 5.      | 15/08/2023              | FOI 25-108 - Classification Certificate  | 2            | Partial access granted                 | s22<br>s47F          |
| 6.      | 13/07/2023              | FOI 25-108 - EA Sports UFC 5 - Master Lyrics   | 4            | Access granted in full                 |                      |
| 7.      | 13/07/2023              | FOI 25-108 - EA Sports UFC 5 - Master Script v1  | 1766         | Access granted in full                 |                      |
| 8.      | 13/07/2023              | FOI 25-108 - EA SPORTS UFC 5 - Online Interactivity Information                        | 2            | Access granted in full                 |                      |
| 9.      | 13/07/2023              | FOI 25-108 - EA Sports UFC 5 - Product Description                                     | 2            | Access granted in full                 |                      |
| 10.     | 13/07/2023              | FOI 25-108 - EA SPORTS UFC 5 - ACB Build   | 1            | Access granted in full                 |                      |
| 11.     | 13/07/2023              | FOI 25-108 - EA SPORTS UFC 5 - In-game purchases                                       | 1            | Access granted in full                 |                      |
| 12.     | 13/07/2023              | FOI 25-108 - EA Sports UFC 5 - Contentious Material                                    | 10           | Access granted in full                 |                      |
| 13.     | 11/07/2023 - 17/07/2023 | FOI 25-108 - RE ACB SUBMISSION EA SPORTS UFC 5 PS5 XSX                                 | 4            | Partial access granted                 | s22<br>s47F          |
| 14.     | 20/09/2024              | FOI 25-108 - EA Sports UFC 5 - National Classification Database Record Screen Captures | 4            | Access granted in full                 |                      |